

### Civic Engagement in the New Political Environment May 1st, 2018 2018 Local Solutions: Eastern Climate Preparedness Conference







ANTIGH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

Justin Rolfe-Redding, ABD Social Science Fellow Christa Daniels, PhD, AICP Program Manager & Faculty



Capacity

### ANTIOCH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

#### Local Bolitheres Eastern Regional Climate Preparedness Conference

Convened by Antioch University's Center for Climate Preparedness & Community Resilience in partnership with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

April 4-6, 2016 • Baltimore, Maryland



**Applied Research** 

### Education &

**Mission:** Strengthen communities to prepare, respond and recover in the face of climate impacts and other disruptions through collaborative, innovative solutions. www.communityresilience-center.org

### **The Climate Advocacy Lab**

Helping climate and clean energy advocates run smarter public engagement campaigns.



2,000+ members



#### Workshops & Webinars



#### Hey 31, 2016 Field Test Comparing Pro-Solar Messengers on Several Channels

Summary

This test sought to determine if a homeowner messenger or a solar worker messenger was more effective in convincing either NV residents or US residents to sign a petition in support of solar nei-metering policies. Test results were inconclusive, but our report points to supficient shortcomings of Facebook Ads for valideting message tests, and points to subtale alternatives.

#### Campaign Background

Last fail, Nevada's Public Utility Commission was considering a proposal from the State's dominant Utility to hike electricity rates for owners of rooftop solar systems. If passed, the proposed rates would severely limit the growth of rooftop solar installations in the state.

Our project objective was to recruit Nevada residents, and those already engaged with US climate advocacy groups, to sign a petition to the Nevada Public UIIIty Commission opposing the new rates. In addition, we wanted to increase participation by our supporters in a patch-through system that facilitated direct phone calls to the NVPUC:

#### Initial Test Design

Our beginning hypothesis was that engagement rates with messages delivered by homeowners and oalar industry worknes would result in higher rates of engagement than typical appeals issued by our staff. We based the hypothesis on evidence drawn from response for scent email and ascall media campaigns where we saw higher engagement rates on content featuring people directly impacted by climate change such as food and wildre survivors.

Our next step was to scan the Climate Advocacy Lab network for contacts that could help us set up a rigorous test. We set up a call with Dr. Gabriele Wong-Parodi of

### Grant-making







### **The Climate Advocacy Lab**









### What we're going to cover today

- Knowing they audience in 2018
- Numbers numb, stories sell
- Targeting methods for climate engagement
- Scientific consensus messaging
- Communicating through values
- [Bonus awesome guidance, if time...]



## Your turn for introductions!

+what you are most looking forward to in this session

## Where are we in 2018?

Good, Bad, or Ugly?



### **'ADAPTATION DEFICIT'**

Is the American Public Engaged on the issue?



The US Third National Climate Assessment (NCA) lists implementation as the number one significant gap in the state of adaptation in the U.S. WHAT IS THE MOST IMPORTANT AND FIRST STEP IN COMMUNICATION & ENGAGEMENT?

**Know Thy Audience...** 



ANTIGH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

## Know Thy Audience...

# Where are American's at with knowing and feeling?



of Americans believe global warming is happening with **54%** ving it is human caused. October 2017.





GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY CENTER for CLIMATE CHANGE COMMUNICATION

### **Scientific Consensus**



ANTIGH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience



Climate Change is Happening and Human Caused



What percent of the American Public understand above?





ANTIOCH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

Most Americans believe global warming will primarily harm future generations and plant/animal species.

**Only 23% are Very Worried** 



Lack of personal worry



GEORGE MASON UNIVERSITY CENTER for CLIMATE CHANGE COMMUNICATION

### A Majority of Americans Think Humans Can Reduce Global Warming

- But few are optimistic that we will -

Which of the following statements comes closest to your view?



Hope Missing: no awareness of solutions

### So...Does concern mean people want change, and does it even matter what they think?

# ...and how does where we are today compare to the past?

### Up and down with climate: The issue-attention cycle



(Downs, 1972)

### Climate opinion since before 2000



### Composite index of multiple survey measures



### Only Half of Americans Have Thought About Global Warming More Than "A Little"

How much had you thought about global warming before today?



23

### About One in Three Americans Say They Discuss Global Warming With Family and Friends "Often" or "Occasionally"



How often do you discuss global warming with your family and friends? March 2018. Base: Americans 18+.



# **?CLIMATE TRIVIA?**

### Are people with higher levels of science literacy more concerned about climate change?

NO: High scientific literacy makes us better at justifying our own worldviews. It does not necessarily align with expert consensus **MOTIVATED REASONING** 

# PRIVATE TRIVIA?

According to recent polling AFTER the Election, what percent of American voters support more government action to speed up the shift to clean energy?

a) 32%
b) 61%
c) 74%
d) 86%

# PRIVATE TRIVIA?

If someone feels they can't have a positive impact on impending global warming, are they more likely to:

- a) See non existent patterns in unrelated pictures
- b) Tend to believe in conspiracy theories
- c) Do nothing
- d) Less likely to uncover information on the issue
- e) All of the Above

## Communicating Climate Change: Do we really know our audience?





# **Numbers Numb**

# **Stories Sell**

## **Barriers to Engagement**

**Issue Polarization** (*obvious*)





### **Efficacy Gap**

(Can I do anything meaningful?)

Lack of Urgency/Concern (not me, not here, not now)

**Psychological Processing** *(huh?)* 





ANTIGEH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience





### **Psychological Processes**

Risk Processing Discounting the Future Optimism Bias Cultural Cognition Cognitive Dissonance Heuristics Psychological Distancing (not me not here not now)







ANTIGEN UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

### I'm going to tell you 3 pairs of words. Remember them without writing them down

Drew Weston, Emory University



## Targeting Methods

For Climate Change Engagement


## Types of targeting

Microtargeting

Multivariate segmentation

Demographics

# Traditional demographic targeting

	Mostly because of						
	Earth is warming	Human activity	Natural patterns	(VOL.) DK/Ref	Not warming	Mixed DK/Ref	N
	96	%	%	%	%	%	
TOTAL	59	34	18	6	32	10	2251
SEX							
Men	55	31	17	7	36	9	1017
Women	62	37	19	6	27	11	1234
AGE							
18-49	61	38	17	6	29	10	939
50+	56	30	19	7	34	10	1284
DETAILED AGE							
18-29	66	43	17	6	25	10	325
30-49	58	36	17	6	33	9	614
50-64	57	33	18	6	35	8	737
65+	55	25	20	9	33	12	547
SEX BY AGE							
Men 18-49	58	35	17	6	34	8	471
Men 50+	51	27	17	8	39	10	534
Women 18-49	64	42	17	5	25	11	468
Women 50+	60	32	21	7	30	9	750
RACE							
White, non-Hispanic	55	33	17	6	35	10	1679
Black, non-Hispanic	73	39	26	9	17	10	235

## **Audience Segmentation**

## The Six Americas of Climate Change



Highest belief in global warming Most concerned Most motivated

Lowest belief in global warming Least concerned Least motivated

Proportion represented by area

http://climatecommunication.yale.edu/about/projects/global-warmings-six-americas/

# Microtargeting

#### What is micro-targeting?

## Micro-target | 'mīkrō- 'tärgət | n.

To identify specific individuals for outreach based on their characteristics (as opposed to targeting broad demographic groups like women or millennials).

#### What is a model?

Models are statistical tools that let us identify individuals most likely to act or think a certain way. Models find needles in haystacks.

How micro-targeting models are created



#### What is a model?

<b>Go from THIS list</b>		to		<b>THIS list</b>		
Name	Address	Action-taker?		Name	Address	Action-taker?
José Dias	123 Main St.	????		José Dias	123 Main St.	47%
Jane Doe	567 Gale Ct.	????		Jane Doe	567 Gale Ct.	23%
Li Quan	789 Lee Dr.	????		Li Quan	789 Lee Dr.	67%

#### Micro-targeting to recruit activists along a pipeline's proposed route







BUSINESS

#### Enbridge Energy pulling plug on Sandpiper pipeline

The controversial project would cross wetlands, rivers and tribal lands.

By Mike Hughlett Star Tribune SEPTEMBER 2, 2016 – 6:27AM



#### Models Commonly Used by Climate Advocates

Model Name	Targets those who	Creator	Revised	Best used to identify
Alarmed	Are most concerned & engaged on climate	YPCCC**	12/14	Influential climate "champions"
Environmental Activist	Take environmental action	Catalist	4/15	New action-takers for mobilization
General Activist	Take progressive action	Catalist	3/15	Action-takers among existing supporters
Ideology	Progressives (or conservatives)	Catalist	3/15	Moderate conservatives
Michigan Green Voter	Believe in climate change	Clarity&MLCV*	2015	Beginners on ladder of engagement
Partisanship	Democrats (or Republicans)	Catalist	3/15	New action-takers for mobilization
True Green	Trust environmental groups over others	LCV	6/15	Persuadables open to environmental groups

Green = Includes action-taking as a targeting criteria

Blue = Doesn't include action-taking as a targeting criteria

\* Clarity Campaign Labs & Michigan League of Conservation Voters

\*\* Yale Program on Climate Change Communication

Bold = Top models in predicting climate action taking (patch-throughs, organizer meetings, and petition signings)

### Yale Climate Opinion Maps

#### Estimated % of adults who think global warming is happening, 2016

Display model output:	Global warming is happening	Absolute Value	\$ Permal
Click on map to select	geography, or: Select a State \$ Select a County	4)	



#### Yale Climate Opinion Maps: Where would you engage?



climatecommunication.yale.edu/visualizations-data/ycom-us-2016

# Scientific Consensus Messaging

Talking about the most important climate number







# A story of research, theory, testing, and engagement

### Consensus Message Research



Cook, 2013 and Cook et al., 2013, Doran and Zimmerman, 2009

## Consensus Message Theory

#### The finite pool of worry is guarded by heuristics





#### Most Successful Message Form



"Based on the evidence, 97% of climate scientists have concluded that human-caused climate change is happening."

## Consensus Message Testing

American Association for the Advancement of Science ADVANCING SCIENCE, SERVING SOCIETY

According to a recent report released by the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS), the world's largest general scientific society, several recent peer-reviewed surveys of climate scientists have shown that, based on the evidence, more than 97% of climate scientists are convinced that human caused climate change is occurring.

We thought you might want to know.

## The Consensus Message Worked

Effect of political ideology across message conditions. Note: Perceived Scientific Agreement ranged from 0 to 100.



### **Consensus** <u>Changes Minds</u>

Effect of political ideology across levels of perceived scientific agreement (PSA). Note: Support for U.S. Effort ranged from 1 to 4.



Myers, Maibach, Peters, & Leiserowitz, 2015; van der Linden, Leiserowitz, Feinberg, & Maibach, 2015

### Consensus Message Engagement



Karen Akerlof, GMU



Climate Communication Consortium of Maryland



ANTIGH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

## Know Thy Audience...

# **Working with Stakeholders**

# What are your stakeholders values?

Personal Freedom/Choice Individualism Patriotism Self Reliance Dedication/Hard Work/ **Common Sense** Frugalness Efficiency/Avoid Waste Conservative Morality Uniqueness Innovation

Social Justice Equality Common Good Reciprocity Benevolence Nurturance Cooperation Collective





#### **Framing for Engagement**

#### Challenge

What are the problems we're facing and the context they're happening in?

#### Choice

What action must be taken and why now?

#### Opportunity

What are the benefits of taking action? (value based communication)









ANTIOCH UNIVERSITY New England Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

## **Framing for a Story**



"Planning for different types of housing is vital to support the firefighters, teachers, police officers, and all the hard working men and women protecting our homes and teaching our children. Workforce housing provides the opportunity for families to live and grow in one place over time, while strengthening the local economy"

"Workforce housing is a solution to reducing vehicle emissions from traffic congestion along with creating diverse neighborhoods. It also allows for equality in housing choices for all individuals in a community."



# Framing for a Story

"Many of us an remember a time when you didn't just throw things away. New Englanders are known for avoiding waste because it is the sensible, practical, and conservative way we have always been.





By adopting 'new energy building code', we continue to avoid wastefulness, while creating homes and offices that are warm and comfortable."



ANTION UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

#### **Key Takeaways**



ANTIGEH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

- Focus on local
- Communicate expert consensus
- Begin with what audiences care about
- Build on non-partisan values
- Use LANGUAGE INTELLIGENCE: Emphasize the WE, repetition, short words
- Promote practical solutions that are here now!
- Articulate what will get better if action is taken
- Challenge, Choice, Opportunity

#### www.climateaccess.org/preparation-frame



# Thank you!







ANTIOH UNIVERSITY NEW ENGLAND Center for Climate Preparedness and Community Resilience

justin@climateadvocacylab.org climateadvocacylab.org cdaniels1@antioch.edu communityresilience-center.org

Justin Rolfe-Redding, ABD Social Science Fellow Christa Daniels, PhD, AICP Program Manager & Faculty

# The Science of Empowerment

Leveraging hope and efficacy



## Backdrop

#### The Uninhabitable Earth

Famine, economic collapse, a sun that cooks us: What climate change could wreak — sooner than you think.

By David Wallace-Wells



# What is "Efficacy"?

• **EFFICACY:** Beliefs (thoughts) regarding the ability to successfully execute a course of action and the impact of that action on desired goals
## **Types of efficacy**

- Self efficacy: the belief that I can effectively take action
- **Response efficacy:** belief that my actions meaningfully contribute to collective advocacy
- Collective efficacy: belief that the group is capable of taking action
- Collective response efficacy: belief that advocacy will influence policymakers and/or that policies can actually reduce climate change

## **Does Efficacy Matter?**

#### Efficacy Deficit Among the Alarmed



• Only 27% of them are "very confident" in their ability to take the steps necessary to contact policymakers about climate change

Highest belief in global warming
Most concerned
Most motivated

I feel confident in my ability to write	Strongly Agree	11	27
a letter, email, or phone a	Somewhat Agree	31	42
government official about global	Somewhat Disagree	38	22
warming over the next 12 months.	Strongly Disagree	20	9

http://environment.yale.edu/climate-communication-OFF/files/Six-Americas-March-2012.pdf

So no surprise most Alarmed haven't engaged in recent advocacy

#### Four in Ten of the Alarmed Have Written Letters, Emailed, or Phoned a Government Official About Global Warming in the Past 12 Months

- % who say they have done it one or more times in the past 12 months -



Over the past 12 months, how many times have you done the following?\*\*

Base: Americans 18+. November, 2013.

'Caution: Small base.

\*\*2008 wording: Over the past 12 months, how many times have you written letters, emailed, or phoned government officials to urge them to take action to reduce global warming?



George Meson University Center for Climate Change Communication

http://climatecommunication.yale.edu/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/Behavior-November-2013.pdf



(Doherty & Webler, 2016)

#### **Efficacy (empowerment) begets action**



#### **Types of efficacy**

- **Self efficacy**: "I am capable of acting!"
- **External efficacy**: "Politicians will listen!"
- **Response efficacy**: "Solutions will work!"

#### Self-Efficacy msg $\rightarrow$ Hope $\rightarrow$ Action Intentions



proposal.

Feldman & Hart, Science Communication. 2016

## Efficacy images/text→ Efficacy beliefs→ Action intentions



Image of solar panels

NOTE: Not the exact images used in study

Hart & Feldman, Science Communication, 20

## Efficacy images/text that did NOT increase Efficacy beliefs (relative to solar panels and action text)



Image of flooding, climate march, power plant Text describing impacts ONLY

NOTE: Not the exact images used in study

Hart & Feldman, Science Communication, 20

# OK. Fair Enough. But how do we Increase Efficacy?

#### Example: The Save EPA "Practical Guide for Resisting the Trump Agenda"



Save EPA - <u>http://www.saveepaalums.info/</u> 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition, July 23, 2017

- Offers insights and advice for making agencies <u>listen</u>. Through this Guide, you will learn how to be an <u>effective</u> advocate
- Provides basic information about how regulations are made
- Offers advice about how to participate effectively in the rulemaking process
- Describes how to find out about deregulatory actions and provides links to organizations tracking those actions

## **Bank of Tested Images**

	climatevisuals
	An evidence-based resource for visual climate change communication
4	Climate impacts are amotionally powerful Climate impacts make for powerful images. It is therefore good if such images also convery clear actions one can take
	I want images that. Images that evoke positive emotions

climatevisuals.org/

#### Increasing self-efficacy: The belief that I can take action

- Direct & vicarious experience and 'can do' attitude<sup>1</sup>
  - Phone numbers, scripts, showing others like them have done it successfully
- Very specific advice on what action to take<sup>2</sup>
- Encouraging people to engage in simple, easy behaviors (such as submitting public comments) is associated with self-efficacy, which then increases rates of subsequent, more challenging actions<sup>3</sup>
- Increasing collective efficacy—confidence in a group's ability to take action—boosts individuals' self-efficacy, and thus increases intentions to take climate action<sup>4</sup>
- Address Barriers: Show them how easy it is to take action

<sup>1</sup>Bandura, 1997; <sup>2</sup>Hine et al, 2013; <sup>3</sup>Luaren et al., 2016; <sup>4</sup>Jugert et al., 2016

## Increasing personal response efficacy: The belief that individual actions matter

- Simply telling supporters that individual actions are effective leads people to action<sup>4</sup>
- Show how personal actions add up to collective goal<sup>1</sup>
- Provide information on climate impacts<sup>2</sup>
- Convince people that their opinions matter, and are listened to<sup>3</sup>

# Increasing collective efficacy: The belief that we can pull off a campaign together

- Promote identification with your group<sup>1</sup>
- Promote cohesion among group members<sup>2</sup>
- Images of protests have not been shown to boost efficacy<sup>3</sup>
  - (But the study was conducted on a representative sample of Americans)

# Increasing collective response efficacy: The belief that together we can win

- Believing that many others like you are taking action increases collective response efficacy<sup>1</sup>
- Positive signals about the leadership of the group<sup>2</sup>
- Framing future climate trajectories optimistically (the glass half full)<sup>3</sup>
- Avoid Cynicism: Don't feed notion that politicians won't listen
- Visualize Success: Images of solar panels, not pollution and disasters
- Lay out the Plan: Describe the realistic strategy to cut fossil fuels and promote clean energy

<sup>1</sup> Doherty & Webler 2016; <sup>2</sup>Jung & Sosik, 2002; <sup>3</sup>Morton, Rabinovich, Marshall, & Bretschneider, 2011;